UN Handbook on Carbon Taxation for Developing Countries

Session III: The Administrative Aspects of a Carbon Tax Joint Indonesia-Sweden-ADB-CFMCA Workshop Jakarta, Indonesia 4 October 2023



Background Putting an explicit price on carbon via a carbon tax





UN Tax Committee

Subcommittee on Environmental Tax Issues 2017-2021

- Subcommittee established in 2017 (chaired by Natalia Aristizabal Mora, Columbia; range of experts from government, academia and business)
- 2017-2021 => Handbook on Carbon Taxation
 - UN Handbook on Carbon Taxation for Developing Countries (2021) | Financing for Sustainable Development Office
 - A practical, hands-on guide for policy makers
 - Properly designed, a carbon tax is easy to administer and gives results in a cost-efficient way



UN Tax Committee

Subcommittee on Environmental Tax Issues 2021-2025

- Subcommittee current mandate:
 - "Produce practical guidelines on targeted, additional, and emerging issues in the area of carbon taxation, which are not covered or fully developed in the Handbook on Carbon Taxation for Developing Countries. Work on any additional relevant environmental taxation issues as requested by the Committee"
- Co-coordinators: Muhammad Ashfaq Ashmed (Pakistan) and Susanne Åkerfeldt (Sweden)
- About 25 experts from across the globe

- Five specific workstreams:
 - 1. Interaction of carbon taxation with other national measures (lead drafter Stefan Weishaar)
 - 2. Role of carbon taxation in supporting energy transition (lead drafters An Theeuwes and Jim Robertson)
 - 3. Interaction between carbon taxation and carbon offset programs (lead drafter Amparo Grau Ruiz)
 - 4. Border Carbon Adjustment Mechanisms (lead drafter Christopher Morgan)
 - 5. Other environmental taxes than carbon taxation (lead drafters Hira Nazir and Armin Monostori Hartmann)

UN Handbook on Carbon Taxation for Developing Countries In more detail



The Handbook – main elements

- Why introduce a carbon tax?
- How to generate public acceptance?
- Design in general and in more detail
- Setting the tax rate
- How to address undesired effects
- Practical administration
- Revenue use
- Interaction with other instruments

- About 200 pages
- Hands-on guide
- Overview of main elements to consider
- Focus on 'how to do it' rather than 'academic theory'
- Take account of local context

=>=> Let's look into a bit more of the content!

General Intro for Policymakers

Chapter 2: An Introduction for Policymakers	16
1. Introduction	16
2. The environmental problem: climate change and carbon emissions	16
3. Carbon emissions: a global policy problem	18
4. Carbon pricing	20
4.1 Carbon emission reductions and Government policies	20
4.2 Carbon pricing instruments	2
5. A Carbon Tax	23
6. Motives for the introduction of a carbon tax	24
6.1 Fighting climate change by reducing carbon emissions (the	
"green" dividend)	
6.2 Generation of budgetary sources	25
6.3 Promotion of investment in new technology	
7. Policy considerations in the introduction of a carbon tax	
7.1 Certainty and predictability of the price of carbon	
7.2 Administration of the carbon tax	
7.3 Potential distributional implications and corrective measures	
7.4 Safeguarding the competitiveness of domestic industries	
8. Conclusion	
9. References	
Appendix 1: Emission Trading Systems (ETS) vs taxes and cost-efficiency	
A1. ETS and taxes	
A2. Carbon pricing and markets	
A3. References	35

- Global climate problem
- Motives for a carbon tax
 - Reduce carbon emissions
 - Generates revenues
 - Promote investment in green technology
- Main policy considerations
 - Predictability for operators
 - Cost-efficient design and administration
 - Distributional effects
 - Competitiveness of domestic industries

Public Acceptability

Chapter 3: How to Generate Public Acceptability for Carbon Taxes	36
1. Introduction	36
2. Designing a feasible carbon tax	36
2.1 The importance of acceptability	
3. Explaining attitudes towards carbon taxes	
4. How to generate public acceptability	40
4.1 The role of political and institutional trust	
4.2 Focus on the revenues	

- 6 -

Table of Contents

	4.3 The importance of perceived fairness	42
	4.4 Searching for windows of opportunity	43
	4.5 Consider trial periods	43
	4.6 Examples of potential policy-mixes/packages	
	4.7 Measuring acceptability in due time	
5.	Conclusion	
3.	References	47

- Importance of acceptability
 - Not a 'tax grab'
- Perceived fairness
- Involve stakeholders in consultations
- Political trust
- Windows of opportunity
 - Part of more general reforms?
- Step-by-step approach
- Policy packages
 - Make sure that feasible options are available

General Design Features

Chapter 4: General Issues in Designing a Carbon Tax	
1. Introduction	49
2. A carbon tax in context with other forms of taxation	49
3. Who faces the cost of a carbon tax?	50
4. Taxing power	
4.1 Taxing power boundaries	
4.2 Existing institutional frameworks for setting and collecting taxes	
4.3 Distinct features of a carbon tax	52
4.4 Constitutional rules regarding taxing power	53
4.5 Special considerations for jurisdictions with subnational levels	54
5. Scope of the carbon tax	56
5.1 What to tax?	56
5.2 Who will pay the tax?	58
5.3 How to tax?	58
6. Conclusion	60
7. References	6

- Who faces the cost of a carbon tax?
 - Who pays the tax vs who faces the cost
- Taxing power boundaries
 - Federal and subnational taxes
 - Other institutional and constitutional frameworks to consider
- Scope of the carbon tax
 - Carbon emissions or also other greenhouse gas emissions?
 - Fuel Approach or Direct Emissions Approach?

Carbon Tax Design two main approaches

Chapter 6: Carbon Tax Design Approaches in Practice	7
1. Introduction	7
2. The Fuel Approach	7
2.1 Basic concept	7
2.2 Carbon tax rates applied to different fuels in practice	8
2.3 Point of regulation and tax payment	8
2.3.1 Carbon tax due early in the distributional chain	8
2.3.2 Carbon tax due later in the distributional chain	8
2.4 Using an existing fuel taxation administrative system	
2.5 Coverage of fuels by the Fuel Approach	8
2.6 Methodology to calculate a carbon tax by the Fuel Approach	8
2.7 Tax rates are presented in the tax law in weight or volume units	8
2.8 Differentiation based on fuel quality	
2.9 Some aspects relating to carbon content in fuels of biomass origin	8
2.10 Low blends of ethanol and biodiesel into petrol and diesel	8
2.11 Taking account of the biomass part of petrol and diesel when	
calculating the carbon tax rate	8
2.12 Summing up	
3. The Direct Emissions Approach	
3.1 Basic concept	
3.2 Coverage of emissions by the Direct Emissions Approach	
3.3 Taxpayer	9
3.4 Methodology to calculate the tax payment by the Direct Emissions	
Approach	
3.5 Measuring, Reporting and Verification Systems (MRV)	
3.6 Point of regulation	
3.7 Institutions involved	
3.8 Summing up the Direct Emissions Approach	
4. Considering the different carbon tax approaches	
5. Conclusion	
6. References	
Appendix 2: Taxation of air and maritime transport	
A1. Introduction	
A2. Commercial air transport	
A3. International maritime transport	10

Fuel Approach

- Calculate tax rates based on average carbon content of fuels = tax rates expressed in litres, tons etc
- Point of regulation upstream or downstream?
- Using existing fuel tax administration

• Direct Emissions Approach

- Making use of MRV (measuring, reporting and verification) systems necessary for UNFCC reporting
- Focus on stationary installations



How to Set the Tax Rate

Chapter 5: Setting the Tax Rate	62
1. Introduction	62
2. Basic considerations for setting the tax rate	62
3. The theoretical framework	
3.1 Theory of externalities	63
3.2 Pigouvian taxation – internalising external costs	64
4. Practical approaches to set the carbon tax rate	65
4.1 Standards and Price Approach – to reach a specific carbon	
reduction target	65
4.2 Revenue Target Approach	66
4.3 Benchmarking Approach	68
5. Dynamic Tax Rates	71
5.1 The role of politics	71
5.2 Tax Rate trajectory	
5.3 Regular adjustments of the Tax Rate	73
6. Setting tax rates under challenging circumstances	
7. Conclusion	

- In theory
- In practice ...

Addressing Undesired Effects

Chapter 7: Addressing Undesired Effects on Households and Fi	rms 107
1. Introduction	107
2. Possible adverse effects from carbon taxation	107

- 8 -

Table of Contents

2.1 Negative impacts on households	107
2.2 Negative effects on firms	108
2.3 Concerns over carbon leakage	110
3. Assessing the risk of negative effects	112
4. Policy options to address concerns over unwanted adverse effects	113
4.1 Tax-reducing measures	115
4.2 Support measures	116
4.3 Trade-related measures	
5. Administrative simplicity, environmental integrity, and fairness	122
6. Examples of carbon tax introduction: Two-level tax systems and thresholds	
7. Conclusion	
8. References	

- Poor households
- Local industry
- Different options
 - Tax reductions
 - Support schemes
 - Thresholds
 - Limitations in scope
- Carbon leakage

Tax Administration

Chapter 8: From Design to Administration: Practical Application of a

Carbon Tax	128
1. Introduction	128
2. General issues in tax administration	128
3. General issues in carbon tax administration	129
3.1 Institutions and their responsibilities	129
3.2 Stakeholders and public engagement	133
3.3 Transition period considerations	135
3.4 Coordination with overlapping policy instruments	13
4. Core features of the carbon tax	
5. Considerations regarding detailed administrative regulations to	
manage the carbon tax	140
5.1 Registering taxpayers	
5.2 Tax returns (declaration) and book-keeping	142
5.3 Tax exemptions and reimbursements	144
5.4 Period to file the tax return	
5.5 Securing the payment of the tax due	145
5.6 Liability thresholds	146
5.7 Control mechanisms and emissions reporting	146
5.8 Compliance and enforcement mechanisms	
6. Ex-post evaluation of a carbon tax	150
7. Conclusions	15
8. References	153

- Institutions and their responsibilities
- Tax-payers and tax returns
- Securing tax payment and control mechanisms
- Ex-post evaluations



Revenue Use

Chapter 9: Revenue Use	154
1. Introduction	154
2. Options for revenue use	154
2.1 Compensation for vulnerable industries	154
2.2 Compensation for households	155
-	

- 9 -

United Nations Handbook On Carbon Taxation For Developing Countries

2.3 Environmental spending	157
2.4 Tax shifts	158
3. Administrative systems to commit tax revenues	159
4. Transparency and Communication	160
5. Conclusion	161
6. References	163
Appendix 3: Carbon tax revenue in perspective	164
A1. Current carbon tax revenue	164
A2. Potential carbon tax revenue	165
A3. References	168

- Ear marking or into general budget?
- Compensation schemes for households and firms
- Environmental spending

Interaction with Other Instruments

Chapter 10: Interactions Between the Carbon Tax and Other Instruments	169
1. Introduction	169
2. Carbon Tax to be considered in context	169
3. Assessing the interaction	169
3.1 Complementary policies	170
3.2 Overlapping policies	172
3.3 Countervailing policies	173
4. Policies and instruments interacting with a carbon tax	174
4.1 Carbon tax as one of the carbon pricing mechanisms	175
4.2 Fuel and energy taxation	175
4.3 Investment incentives	176
4.4 Fossil fuel subsidies	177
5. Addressing interactions	177
5.1 Adjusting the carbon tax	178
5.2 Adjusting pre-existing policies	179
5.3 Ensuring policies are complementary	180
6. Hybrids	181
7. Conclusions	181
8. References	183
Appendix 4: Fossil fuel subsidies	184
A.1 References	186

- A carbon tax is not introduced in a policy vacuum
- Need to consider existing and potential new instruments
 - Complementary => improve effectiveness
 - Overlapping => risk for create inefficiency
 - Countervailing => undermine the effectiveness



Key Take-Aways Why a carbon tax is a good idea

- Reduced emissions can be combined with longterm economic development and prosperity
- Fine-tune policy design what works in one country may not work well in another
- Public acceptability
 - Policy packages
 - Different options to address undesired effects
- Low administrative costs; ETS schemes more complicated and costly
- Raises revenues, can be used to make options available
- Discuss with stake holders and academia; cooperate within Government offices and with relevant authorities



Questions?

Contact information:

Susanne Åkerfeldt Senior Adviser Tax and Customs Department Ministry of Finance, Sweden E-mail: <u>susanne.akerfeldt@gov.se</u> Phone: +46 8 405 1382

